

**Journal Club I**  
**Fall 2007**

<b>Postdoc Mentors:</b>	Peter Roper	LCB 313	roper@math.utah.edu
	Berton Earnshaw	LCB 301	earnshaw@math.utah.edu
<b>Graduate Assistant:</b>	Courtney Davis	LCB 306	davis@math.utah.edu
<b>Faculty Support:</b>	Alla Borisyuk	LCB 303	borisyuk@math.utah.edu

**Webpage:** [www.math.utah.edu/~earnshaw/journalclub](http://www.math.utah.edu/~earnshaw/journalclub)

**Procedures:**

1. Each student must identify a paper to present during the semester before Friday, August 31st. A collection of approved papers are sitting on Berton's desk. Other papers must be approved by either Pete or Berton.
2. Shortly before each presentation, the presenter should meet with Courtney to discuss their planned presentation.
3. At the beginning of each presentation, all students excluding the presenter are required to hand to either Pete or Berton a written summary of the paper to be presented. These summaries must contain more content than the paper's abstract; beyond a summary of the major arguments and techniques of the paper, they must contain a critique of the paper that could include 1) a summary of those arguments of the paper that seem convincing on the one hand or unsubstantiated on the other, and 2) further questions regarding the major arguments or techniques of the paper.
4. Each presentation should follow these guidelines:
  - (a) The presenter will spend no more than 10 minutes explaining their chosen paper. This includes 1) describing the main reason or reasons the authors wrote the paper, 2) providing a brief outline of the paper, and 3) highlighting interesting and/or novel arguments and techniques used in the paper.
  - (b) After the introduction, no more than 10 minutes will be provided for questions and answers.
  - (c) The presenter is then given no more than 10 minutes to walk the other participants through the major arguments of the paper, taking time to explain in detail parts of the paper that the presenter finds important and/or interesting. Emphasis should be placed on the mathematical content of the paper.
  - (d) After this, no more than 10 minutes will be provided for additional questions and answers.
  - (e) The presenter is then given no more than 10 minutes to conclude their talk by 1) summarizing again the major arguments of the paper and 2) commenting on whether or not the authors effectively achieved the aims of the paper.
  - (f) After this, no more than 10 minutes will be provided for additional questions and answers.
  - (g) Sometime after the presentation, Pete and Berton will meet with the presenter and give a brief but kind critique of their presentation.
5. Each student will be given an A for their participation as long as they present a paper and provide written summaries for all other papers, otherwise they will be given a lower grade to be determined by Pete and Berton. Also, at the end of the semester Pete and Berton will provide a written evaluation of each student to the math biology faculty for use by these faculty in assessing the progress of each student, choosing an appropriate mentor for each student, etc.